



Setti D. Warren
Mayor

City of Newton, Massachusetts
Department of Planning and Development
1000 Commonwealth Avenue Newton, Massachusetts 02459

Telephone
(617) 796-1120
Telefax
(617) 796-1142
TDD/TTY
(617) 796-1089
www.newtonma.gov

Candace Havens
Director

**MINUTES OF PUBLIC MEETING AND PUBLIC HEARINGS
NEWTON HISTORICAL COMMISSION**

DATE: February 27, 2014

PLACE/TIME: City Hall, Room 202
7:30 p.m.

ATTENDING:

| | |
|------------------------------|--------------------------|
| David Morton, Acting-Chair | Mark Armstrong, Member |
| Jean Fulkerson, Member | Rodney Barker, Member |
| Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate | Bill Roesner, Member |
| Nancy Grissom, Member | Ellen Klapper, Alternate |
| Len Sherman, Member | Katy Hax Holmes, Staff |
| See Attendance List | |

ABSENT:

The meeting was called to order at 7:30 p.m. with David Morton presiding as Acting-Chair. Voting permanent members were Morton, Armstrong, Fulkerson, Barker, Roesner, and Grissom. Alternate member Klapper voted beginning with the 45 Murray Road agenda item. Barker left the meeting after the vote on 3 Auburn Street. Fitzmaurice was selected to vote after Barker's departure. Katy Holmes acted as recording secretary and the meeting was digitally recorded on an H2 device.

Newton City Hall Access and Acoustics proposal

This item was withdrawn by the Public Buildings Department due to the fact that the scope had changed. Public Buildings will return with a revised scope for future NHC review.

Angier Elementary School – MOA review

Leno DePhillippe, an architect for the new Angier School project, provided a brief Powerpoint summary of the three items previously identified by the NHC as recommended mitigation for the loss of the historic Angier School building. The first item was to identify historic elements from the school that could be incorporated into the new school; the second was to show how the design for the new school took into account the National Register listed buildings in the immediate vicinity of this project; and the third was to learn the results of the archeological assessment of the site. Discussion ensued regarding the NHC's purview over the project and whether architectural elements in the new building successfully emulated those from surrounding historic buildings.

Grissom made a motion that the mitigation strategies as proposed by the Public Buildings Division for the new Angier School building successfully met the criteria for inclusion in the Memorandum of Understanding with the Massachusetts Historical Commission. Armstrong seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on February 27, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 5-1:

RESOLVED that the mitigation strategies as proposed by the Public Buildings Division for the new Angier School building successfully met the NHC criteria for inclusion in the Memorandum of Understanding with the Massachusetts Historical Commission.

| <u>Voting in the Affirmative:</u> | <u>Voting in the Negative</u> | <u>Abstained</u> |
|-----------------------------------|-------------------------------|------------------|
| David Morton, Acting-Chair | Rodney Barker, Member | |
| Bill Roesner, Member | | |
| Jean Fulkerson, Member | | |
| Mark Armstrong, Member | | |
| Nancy Grissom, Member | | |

130 Day Street - Demolition Review

Request to demolish house.

Property owners Parag and Puja Vohra presented an application for a full demolition of the house. Reasons for its removal were due to its condition, and the desire of the applicant to construct a LEED certified home for their family.

Staff reported that the house was built in 1941, and that the house was designed by H.D. Tobin and built by Clinton Homes as part of a larger neighborhood development of similar capes with distinctive bay windows. In 1959 the owners at the time Charles A. Goodwin (English teacher) and his wife Lois obtained a building permit to install dormers over the garage and kitchen. In 1972 a rear addition was constructed. The owner in 1976, John Golden (stockbroker) obtained a grounding permit for the installation of aluminum siding. He continued to own the house into the 1990s. Though houses in the vicinity of this house have had alterations ranging from a full second story to additional dormers, the neighborhood retains its historic pre-War context and staff recommended that this house be found preferably preserved for neighborhood historical context.

Commission members perused the handouts provided by the owners. The owners said they had considered alterations to the existing structure but they were deemed to be infeasible. They told the Commission that they intended to donate 75% of the materials in their current home to new projects.

Three neighbors provided letters of support for the project that were read into the record. Amy Sangiolo, Ward 4 Alderman also spoke in support of the project and to ask that the house be found not preferably preserved. An abutter living at 144 Day Street also spoke in support of the project and that he liked the fact that the neighborhood would become more architecturally diverse. Isabelle Albrecht of 270 Windsor Road spoke in support of the house being found preferably preserved.

Armstrong made a motion to find the house not preferably preserved. Grissom seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on February 27, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by a vote of 4-2:

RESOLVED to find the house at 130 Day Street not preferably preserved.

| <u>Voting in the Affirmative:</u> | <u>Voting in the Negative</u> | <u>Abstained</u> |
|-----------------------------------|-------------------------------|------------------|
| Rodney Barker, Member | Jean Fulkerson, Member | |
| Dave Morton, Acting Chair | Bill Roesner, Member | |
| Mark Armstrong, Member | | |
| Nancy Grissom, Member | | |

73 Williston Road – Demolition Review

Request to demolish house

Antonio Ferrata, developer for the property, said that the ranch house at this address was outdated and contained an illegal apartment. Abutters attended who were upset that trees had been removed from the property prior to its sale to the current owner. Other abutters were curious to know what the new house would look like.

Staff reported that this house was constructed in 1955 by Hodgson Houses, and the first owner was William B. Graham, a firefighter with Engine 9 in Newton. Graham was the first and only owner until 1999. He obtained a permit to add an addition in 1963. John and Joan Slattery bought the house in 1999 and are still listed as current owners. This is the only Ranch Style house in the immediate neighborhood, and appears to have been constructed later than the surrounding houses (e.g. infill architecture). Windows have been replaced, and additions were added to the east and south. This house is not architecturally or contextually linked to the rest of the neighborhood, and as such staff recommended that the house be found not preferably preserved.

Barker made a motion to find the house preferably preserved. Roesner seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on February 27, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 2-4:

RESOLVED to find the house at 73 Williston Road preferably preserved.

| <u>Voting in the Affirmative:</u> | <u>Voting in the Negative</u> | <u>Abstained</u> |
|-----------------------------------|----------------------------------|------------------|
| Rodney Barker, Member | Jean Fulkerson, Member | |
| Bill Roesner, Member | Mark Armstrong, Member | |
| | Dave Morton, Acting Chair | |
| | Nancy Grissom, Member | |

The motion did not pass.

Grissom made a motion to find the house not preferably preserved. Fulkerson seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on February 27, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 4-2:

RESOLVED to find the house at 73 Williston Road not preferably preserved.

| <u>Voting in the Affirmative:</u> | <u>Voting in the Negative</u> | <u>Abstained</u> |
|-----------------------------------|-------------------------------|------------------|
| Jean Fulkerson, Member | Rodney Barker, Member | |
| Mark Armstrong, Member | Bill Roesner, Member | |
| Dave Morton, Acting Chair | | |

Nancy Grissom, Member

42 Richardson Street – Demolition Review, on the National Register

Request to demolish house

Listed on the National Register of Historic Places as part of a district, staff reported that this Queen Anne Style house was constructed in the late 1880s, replacing an earlier house at this location. Lucas Pinkham, a bookbinder, is listed as an early owner of the house, and the Pinkham family continued to own it until the 1920s. Original fabric on the house includes its massing, the large front gable, two-story bay window, and decorative shingling.

Grissom moved to find the house preferably preserved with an 18-month delay imposed. Roesner seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on February 27, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 6-0:

RESOLVED to find the house at 42 Richardson Street preferably preserved with an 18-month delay imposed.

| | | |
|-----------------------------------|-------------------------------|------------------|
| <u>Voting in the Affirmative:</u> | <u>Voting in the Negative</u> | <u>Abstained</u> |
|-----------------------------------|-------------------------------|------------------|

Jean Fulkerson, Member
Rodney Barker, Member
Mark Armstrong, Member
Bill Roesner, Member
Dave Morton, Acting Chair
Nancy Grissom, Member

48 Churchill Street – Demolition Review

Request to demolish house

Ron Jarek, architect, presented the proposed plan on behalf of the owner to demolish the house.

Staff reported that this house was previously surveyed and was found to be notable as an excellent example of Italianate architecture in Newton. The side hall plan, bracketed eaves, original arched window frames (and quite possibly original windows) are evidence of classic Italianate features that can still be found on this house. Similarly designed Italianate houses are located immediately to the north of this house. To the south are two c.1960 brick and shingle Garrison Colonial style houses. Though listed on the Massachusetts B Form as having been moved to the location in the 1880s, evidence of a house at this location appears as early as 1874 at 48 Clifton Street (before the name was changed to Churchill Street). The house was owned by W.H. Deffrees. In 1886, the owner was J.W. Deffrees. By 1895 the street name was changed to Churchill. From at least 1917 to the sale of the house in 1983, the house was owned by the H.E. Quinlan family. Due to the remarkable retention of architectural detail on this Italianate style house, staff recommended that it be found preferably preserved for its architectural integrity and neighborhood historical context.

Faith Justice of 44 Churchill Street prepared maps and photos to highlight the historic elements of her neighborhood and to support her assertion that hers was a relatively intact Italianate neighborhood that should be preserved. Commission members offered the suggestion of additions rather than full demolition.

Fulkerson made a motion to find the house preferably preserved. Barker seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on February 27, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 6-0:

RESOLVED to find the house at 48 Churchill Street preferably preserved.

| <u>Voting in the Affirmative:</u> | <u>Voting in the Negative</u> | <u>Abstained</u> |
|-----------------------------------|-------------------------------|------------------|
| Jean Fulkerson, Member | | |
| Rodney Barker, Member | | |
| Mark Armstrong, Member | | |
| Bill Roesner, Member | | |
| Dave Morton, Acting Chair | | |
| Nancy Grissom, Member | | |

35 Dartmouth Street

Request to demolish house

The architect for this project presented his opinion that the house was not a ranch, but a hipped-roof, split-level home that did not have qualities worth preserving. Steven Silverman, who told the Commission he was moving into the house, consulted the neighbors and told the Commission that they had no objections to taking down the house. Silverman said he took pains to make sure the new house would fit into the neighborhood.

Staff reported that this Ranch Style house and its attached two-car garage were built in 1959. The property is located on the carriage path of Commonwealth Avenue where it intersects with Dartmouth Street. The house is of painted brick and its first owner was Harold J. Rosenberg, an employee of Rosecrest Manufacturing. In 1969 there was a fire in the garage and the damage was repaired. The house was sold to Barbara Cohen in 2004, who obtained a permit in 2005 to renovate the kitchen and two baths. The house is located in a neighborhood of other brick residences built in the 1920s and early 1930s, and is situated on a corner of what was once a larger lot, which contains a c.1900s brick residence. Though this house could be considered infill architecture in this neighborhood, its architectural context is in keeping with the surrounding homes and for this reason staff recommended that it be found preferably preserved.

Commission members discussed the merits of the house as one that fit into the character of the carriage road. Others believed this house was surrounded by Tutor Style residences that did not match the existing house.

Roesner made a motion to find the house preferably preserved. Barker seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on February 27, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 3-3:

RESOLVED to find the house at 35 Dartmouth Street preferably preserved.

| <u>Voting in the Affirmative:</u> | <u>Voting in the Negative</u> | <u>Abstained</u> |
|-----------------------------------|-------------------------------|------------------|
| Bill Roesner, Member | Jean Fulkerson, Member | |
| Rodney Barker, Member | Mark Armstrong, Member | |
| Dave Morton, Acting Chair | Nancy Grissom, Member | |

There was no majority vote so the motion did not pass.

1453 Centre Street – Demolition Review

Request to demolish house

The developer for this property, Armando _____, presented his plan to demolish the house due to its low ceilings, small rooms, and the fact that it was too expensive to remodel.

Staff reported that this Colonial Revival House was built in 1924 by owner and builder R.A. Vachon. The garage was constructed the same year. In 1929 the earliest resident of the house was George Harrison, a sales manager in Boston. In 1932 a building permit was obtained to add a single-story maid's room at the rear of the house. By 1957 the owner was Thomas L. Cronin, an engineer at U.S. Fidelity and Guarantee. The Cronin family owned the house until 2013. This house is located on a stretch of Centre Street comprised of largely intact 1920s revival-style buildings. Though the windows have been replaced and vinyl French doors have been added to the porch, the original openings are intact. For this reason, staff recommended that this house be found preferably preserved for historical context.

Joanne Baker of 1445 Centre Street spoke to the beauty of the windows and the historic neighborhood. She told the Commission that abutters who lived all around the property were represented here at the meeting. The owners at 1457 Centre Street told the Commission they had lived in the house since 1976 near the site of the Old Baptist Church, and that City Hall was across the street. This was old Newton they said, and it would be a shame to lose it. Abutters from 1461 Centre Street and Old Rogers Road were also in attendance to support saving the house.

Grissom made a motion to find the house at 1453 Centre Street preferably preserved. Barker seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on February 27, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 6-0:

RESOLVED to find the house at 1453 Centre Street preferably preserved.

| <u>Voting in the Affirmative:</u> | <u>Voting in the Negative</u> | <u>Abstained</u> |
|-----------------------------------|-------------------------------|------------------|
|-----------------------------------|-------------------------------|------------------|

| | | |
|----------------------------------|--|--|
| Jean Fulkerson, Member | | |
| Rodney Barker, Member | | |
| Mark Armstrong, Member | | |
| Bill Roesner, Member | | |
| Dave Morton, Acting Chair | | |
| Nancy Grissom, Member | | |

Ellen Klapper was appointed to vote on subsequent agenda items.

34 Larchmont Avenue

Request to demolish house

The developer for the property told the Commission that the house was a non-descript property, and that he wanted to build a new home that met building code. He said the scope of the project was to keep the historic context intact, and that the new home on the site would be very nice.

Staff reported that the house was built in 1930, and that this shingled Tudor Revival Style house was built by John R. Elander, who is listed in permits as the owner, architect and builder. Arthur King, an accountant, was its first occupant in 1932. In 1957 the house was sold to Michael Panella, engineer at the State House in Boston, and he owned the house until January of this year. With the exception of a rear mud room addition, this house appears to be architecturally intact in its massing, Tudor-style banding in the front gable, asymmetrical design, and front entry bay. This house is located in a neighborhood of largely intact 1930s single-family houses, with two other Tudor Revival homes found at 48 and 54 Larchmont. Staff therefore recommended that the house to be preferably preserved for architecture and historical neighborhood context.

Fred Balfour, an abutter to the property who was not in attendance, reportedly sent a fax in support of keeping the building, but staff did not receive it. Commission members stated their belief that the house retained its historic character.

Roesner made a motion to find the house preferably preserved. Fulkerson seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on February 27, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 6-0-1:

RESOLVED to find the house at 34 Larchmont Avenue preferably preserved.

| <u>Voting in the Affirmative:</u> | <u>Voting in the Negative</u> | <u>Abstained</u> |
|-----------------------------------|-------------------------------|----------------------|
| Jean Fulkerson, Member | | Ellen Klapper |
| Rodney Barker, Member | | |
| Mark Armstrong, Member | | |
| Bill Roesner, Member | | |
| Dave Morton, Acting Chair | | |
| Nancy Grissom, Member | | |

3 Auburn Street – Demolition Review

Rick Sewall, developer and owner of this property, presented his appeal to staff's finding of historical significance and the Commission's finding of preferably preserved at last month's meeting. Sewall presented his evidence to show that the house was built later than c.1874 as was reported by staff at last month's meeting. He and his architect Ron Jarek distributed photos of the interior and exterior of the building to assert that the framing could not have constructed prior to the 1920s.

The nature of the appeal that was filed at last month's meeting was to establish whether or not the building at this address met the criteria for historical significance in the Newton ordinance. In preparation for the January 2014 meeting, staff found this building to be significant under the category of "located within 150 feet of a historic district and contextually similar." Staff previously found documentary evidence that this house was built c.1874, and was therefore contextually similar to buildings included in the Myrtle Baptist Neighborhood National Register Historic District, which is located within 150 feet of this building and has a period of significance from c. 1874 to 1953. Mr. Sewall countered that architectural evidence in the house did not support this construction date, and that he believed the house was not constructed until the 1920s.

Further research into the history of the house did not derogate from staff's earlier findings. Water records found at the Engineering Division suggest there may have been a house on this site by 1874, and that it was 'moved back' in 1901. In addition, building permit applications found in the Inspectional Services Department, dated 1921, 1925, and 1937 respectively, refer to the age of the house as 'Old.' Staff

concluded that regardless of whether the building was constructed c.1874 or in the 1920s, both dates met the period of eligibility criteria for contextual similarity to the Myrtle Baptist National Register District.

Sewall stated that the existing building had been altered and was in a deteriorated condition, and that no historic fabric remained. Commission members discussed the building and surrounding neighborhood context. A Commission member stated that the building was a sweet antique, and that its loss would be detrimental to the neighborhood. Mr. Sewall showed photos he had taken of the interior of the structure as evidence of its condition.

Klapper made a motion to reconsider the January 2014 vote to find 3 Auburn Street preferably preserved based on the appeal of the finding of historical significance.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on February 27, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 5-1-1,

RESOLVED to reconsider the January 2014 vote to find 3 Auburn Street preferably preserved.

| <u>Voting in the Affirmative:</u> | <u>Voting in the Negative</u> | <u>Abstained</u> |
|-----------------------------------|-------------------------------|------------------------------|
| Jean Fulkerson, Member | Bill Roesner, Member | Rodney Barker, Member |
| Mark Armstrong, Member | | |
| Dave Morton, Acting Chair | | |
| Nancy Grissom, Member | | |
| Ellen Klapper, Alternate | | |

Klapper made a motion to find the house at 3 Auburn Street not preferably preserved. Armstrong seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on February 27, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 5-1-1,

RESOLVED to reconsider the January 2014 vote to find 3 Auburn Street preferably preserved based on the appeal of the finding of historical significance.

| <u>Voting in the Affirmative:</u> | <u>Voting in the Negative</u> | <u>Abstained</u> |
|-----------------------------------|-------------------------------|------------------------------|
| Jean Fulkerson, Member | Bill Roesner, Member | Rodney Barker, Member |
| Mark Armstrong, Member | | |
| Dave Morton, Acting Chair | | |
| Nancy Grissom, Member | | |
| Ellen Klapper, Alternate | | |

45 Murray Road – Partial Demolition Review

Request to partially demolish residence and construct addition

Peter Sachs, representing the owners who were in attendance, read his letter to the Commission into the record which outlined the changes he made to the drawings presented at this month's hearing in response to comments made by the Commission at last month's hearing. Sachs presented an application to request a partial demolition of the south and front east façades for construction of an addition and gabled bump-out, respectively. Changes made in the new drawings included lower windows on the elevation of the new ell; the ridgeline dropped below the existing pitch of the historic house roof; flush front, and staggered gable peak on the front façade of the historic house with a pediment roof over the entrance. Commission

members reviewed the revised application and discussed whether the owners had sufficiently responded to the Commission's concerns. The owners stated it was their plan to raise their children in the house.

Staff reported that this c.1897 vernacular Queen Anne Style house was located in a neighborhood with a mix of architectural styles and construction dates from the mid-19th century through the mid-20th century. Staff reported that the first owner appeared to be John J. Bannon, an Irish immigrant who is listed in directories as a gardener and a wagon-driver, and who moved to this home in 1897. Evidence in directories suggested that the Bannon family lived in the house through the 1960s. The simple architectural form of this house at one time showed evidence of varied siding patterns in keeping with a vernacular form of the Queen Anne Style, and appeared to be one of the oldest remaining in the neighborhood. The house is in a somewhat altered condition with replacement windows on the front three sides, vinyl siding, and a front porch that appears to have been enclosed in the 20th century. A shed and pentagonal dormer were also added at later dates.

Rodney Barker left the meeting, and Laura Fitzmaurice was designated to vote in his place.

Julia Malakie of 50 Murray Road provided a written statement and short analysis of the project, but chose to verbally summarize her findings for the Commission and said that she thought the addition was too large for the house, property, and neighborhood.

Grissom made a motion to approve the waiver of the demolition delay imposed in January 2014. Klapper seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on February 27, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 7-0,

RESOLVED to waive the demo delay imposed on 45 Murray Road in January 2014.

| <u>Voting in the Affirmative:</u> | <u>Voting in the Negative</u> | <u>Abstained</u> |
|-------------------------------------|-------------------------------|------------------|
| Jean Fulkerson, Member | | |
| Bill Roesner, Member | | |
| Mark Armstrong, Member | | |
| Dave Morton, Acting Chair | | |
| Nancy Grissom, Member | | |
| Ellen Klapper, Alternate | | |
| Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate | | |

19 Maynard Road – Waiver
Request waiver of demo delay

At its regularly scheduled meeting on September 26, 2013, the Commission voted that this property was preferably preserved. The developer and owner returned in January 2014 to apply for a four-month waiver of the demolition delay but it was not granted for the following reasons: Commission members had concerns about the height of the proposed building and its lack of context with similar houses in this post-World War II housing development; that 1.5 stories was preferable to a 2.5 story replacement dwelling; that columns on either side of the front door were not architecturally appropriate, nor were the proposed Palladian windows; and that the garage door openings faced the street.

Staff reported at the January meeting that this 1953 Ranch style residence was located in a West Newton neighborhood of similar Ranch buildings. The first owners were John and Ethel Farrington. John worked

as an engineer. The architect for the building was Ralph I Williams and the building was constructed by Campanelli Homes, a development company founded in 1947 which is responsible for most of the Ranch development in this neighborhood. The building appeared to have had few alterations aside from replacement windows. The roof also had some deterioration as well. The surrounding neighborhood had a strong Ranch architectural context. Though some buildings were replaced and others altered, the overall character of the neighborhood remained. The neighborhood was surveyed as part of a post –WW II historic architecture study in Newton which included the housing development on Maynard Street. In the past few years the Historical Commission reviewed the demolition of 10 Maynard Street and 42 Maynard Street, and neither building had a demolition delay imposed.

The revised plans as presented were lower in height, the proposed columns were removed, and the garage did not face the street, but the house was to be sheathed in vinyl with vinyl windows, and the proposed site plan did not take into account the awkward proposed driveway profile and the potential loss of very old trees.

Roesner made a motion to deny the waiver. The motion was not seconded. Grissom made a motion to approve the requested waiver for this property as presented. Klapper seconded the motion. Grissom then amended her motion to allow the waiver of the demo delay with the proviso that vinyl siding not be used, and that Anderson clad windows may be used. Fitzmaurice seconded the motion.

At a regularly scheduled meeting and public hearing on February 27, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 6-1:

RESOLVED to waive the demolition delay on 19 Maynard Road with the proviso that vinyl siding not be used, and that Anderson clad windows may be used.

| <u>Voting in the Affirmative:</u> | <u>Voting in the Negative</u> | <u>Abstained</u> |
|-------------------------------------|-------------------------------|------------------|
| David Morton, Acting-Chair | Bill Roesner, Member | |
| Nancy Grissom, Member | | |
| Mark Armstrong, Member | | |
| Donald Tellalian, Alternate | | |
| Jean Fulkerson, Member | | |
| Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate | | |

180-182 Cherry Street

Request to partially demolish residence, demolish garage and construct addition

Mingzong Zou of CZ Development, otherwise known as Tom, owner of this house with CZ Development, presented his plans to demolish the garage and the rear north side of the house for an addition.

Staff reported that this c.1870 end-gable house was likely built in the Italianate style but has lost much of its original detail, including brackets, windows, and the front porch. Having said that, the house maintains its massing and historical context in the neighborhood. Evidence of a house at this location first appears on the 1874 insurance maps under the ownership of the J.W. Conroy family, who continue to own the house through the 1960s. By 1971, John Marino was the owner and the two-car garage was built in 1975. The garage, because of its date of construction, does not meet the criteria for the demo delay ordinance and thus is not subject to NHC review. In 2010 a building permit was granted to replace the roof and add a ridge vent. In 2013 the house was sold to CZ Development. The neighborhood is a mix of twentieth-century infill development, as well as Italianate houses with Queen Anne style updates. Due to the fact

that this neighborhood is a transitional mix of styles, with this house representing the oldest style of house in the neighborhood, staff recommended that the house be found preferably preserved.

The abutter living to the north of this house brought his attorney to explain that there was a boundary dispute with Tom over the north property line and the garage. The abutter was told that this dispute was outside of NHC jurisdiction.

Roesner made a motion to find the house preferably preserved. Fitzmaurice seconded the motion.

At a regularly scheduled meeting and public hearing on February 27, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 6-0-1:

RESOLVED to find the house at 180-182 Cherry Street preferably preserved.

Voting in the Affirmative:

David Morton, Acting-Chair
Nancy Grissom, Member
Mark Armstrong, Member
Jean Fulkerson, Member
Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate
Bill Roesner, Member

Voting in the Negative

Abstained

Ellen Klapper

Commission members told Tom that his plans for the property were not appropriate for the size and scale of the historic house and that the window patterns on the new addition should attempt to mirror those on the old house. In addition, the window openings on the historic house should be left intact so as to preserve its historic character. The addition should also be set back from the house and not be co-planar and in a different style from the historic house. The addition should also be lower than the roof line of the historic house, as well as try to match the roof pitch of the house gable. One Commission member said that he thought the proposed addition was so out of scale that he was at a loss as to how to articulate it.

Fitzmaurice made a motion to deny the waiver of the demolition delay on 180-182 Cherry Street. Fulkerson seconded the motion.

At a regularly scheduled meeting and public hearing on February 27, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 7-0:

RESOLVED to deny the waiver of the partial demolition delay at 180-182 Cherry Street.

Voting in the Affirmative:

David Morton, Acting-Chair
Nancy Grissom, Member
Mark Armstrong, Member
Jean Fulkerson, Member
Bill Roesner, Member
Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate
Ellen Klapper, Alternate

Voting in the Negative

Abstained

51 Plainfield Street – On the National Register; Waiver

Armando Petruzzello, owner of this property came to the NHC in May 2013 where the property was found preferably preserved; and then in September and November 2013 for a waiver for a full demo, and each

time a waiver was not granted. The owner returned with what he thought were revised plans in order to once again attempt to obtain a waiver. This is what Brian Lever reported on the building for the May meeting:

“This 1922 Dutch Colonial residence is located with the Pine Ridge Road and Plainfield Street National Register Historic District and therefore subject to an 18-month demolition delay. The district is listed for its architectural significance as an example of a transitional neighborhood with late 19th century architectural styles of Queen Anne and Shingle mixing with Colonial Revival, Craftsman and Tudor styles of the 20th century. The neighborhood is also listed for its association with the development of the village of Waban as a suburban neighborhood accessible to Boston via the train. The first occupants of this building were Rawson and Mabel Cohen. Rawson was a salesman in Boston. Later the building was owned by Benjamin and Helen Bullman. Benjamin worked as a heating engineer. Shortly after permitting the construction of the building, an attached garage was added to the side and rear of the building. The addition has matching brick and the garage doors face the rear of the property. Aside from the addition, the building appears to have no substantial alterations and retains its shiplap siding, windows, and wood trim. The building is also consistent in scale and style with others in the neighborhood and is listed as a contributing building to the district, staff’s recommendation is to find the building preferably preserved.”

In September 2013, the waiver was not approved for the following reasons: Commission members felt that additions could be added that have desirable modern amenities rather than a full demolition of the National Register-listed property. In November 2013, the waiver was not approved due to the Commission’s belief that additions off the back of the building could help to save its historic integrity, and that the new design placed most of the bulk of the building at the front of the lot unlike the existing building. At the February meeting, the owner and developer presented an older set of plans by mistake and promised to return to a future meeting with revised plans.

Administrative Discussion:

Minutes

The November, December 2013 and January 2014 meeting minutes were not presented for approval at this meeting.

Meeting adjourned 10:50 PM